## Chapter 4

## Home Environment Support for Science Achievement

Home resources for learning and high expectation by parents and students for education were related to higher average achievement at the fourth and eighth grades.

Considerable research supports the fundamental importance of a supportive home environment in shaping children's achievement in school. Internationally, IEA studies in science through four cycles of TIMSS have found a strong positive relationship between students' science achievement at the fourth and eighth grades and home environments that foster learning.

This chapter presents the fourth grade TIMSS 2011 science achievement results in relation to parents' reports about the following: 1) their children's home resources for learning, 2) their children's language experiences before starting school, 3) their educational expectations for their children, and 4) their children's attendance at preprimary education. The parents' data were collected using the TIMSS \& PIRLS 2011 Learning to Read Survey in which students' parents or primary caregivers were asked to provide information about their child's home environment and early educational experiences, and so are available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students. The chapter also presents the eighth grade science achievement in relation to students' own reports about several aspects of their home environment and their educational expectations.

## Home Resources for Learning

The TIMSS \& PIRLS 2011 Learning to Read Survey asked students' parents to report on the availability of three key home resources highly related to student achievement in school:

- Parents' education;
- Parents' occupation; and
- Number of children's books in the home.

In addition, students were asked about:

- Number of books in the home; and
- Availability of two study supports at home-An Internet connection and their own room.

Research consistently shows a strong positive relationship between achievement and socioeconomic status (SES), or indicators of socioeconomic status such as parents' or caregivers' level of education or occupation. TIMSS, PIRLS, and PISA have found strong positive relationships between level

TIMSS \& PIRLS
of parents' education and/or occupation and their children's educational attainment. In general, higher levels of education can lead to careers in higher paying professions, higher socioeconomic status, and more home resources. However, the benefits of higher levels of parents' education can extend to having more positive beliefs and higher expectations toward educational achievement transfer to their children. Availability of reading material in the home likewise is strongly related to achievement in mathematics and science as well as in reading. IEA's TIMSS studies have consistently shown that students with a large number of books in the home have higher achievement in mathematics and science.

Exhibit 4.1 presents the results for the TIMSS 2011 Home Resources for Learning scale, which was created based on parents' and students' reports about the five types of home resources described above. Results are shown for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS fourth grade assessments to the same fourth grade students. The second page of the exhibit provides detail about the questions forming the scale and the categorization of responses. Students were scored according to the availability of the five home resources, with Many Resources corresponding to more than 100 books in the home, having both their own room and an Internet connection, more than 25 children's books, at least one parent having completed university, and one with a professional occupation, on average. Few Resources corresponds, on average, to having 25 or fewer books, neither of the home study supports, 10 or fewer children's books, neither parent having gone beyond upper secondary school, and neither having a business, clerical, or professional occupation.

Countries are ordered by the percentage of students in the Many Resources category, with the fourth grade countries on the first page of the exhibit and the sixth grade and benchmarking participants on the second page. Internationally, on average, almost three-quarters of the fourth grade students (74\%) were assigned to the Some Resources category. Seventeen percent, on average, were in the Many Resources category and nine percent internationally were in the Few Resources category, with a 131-point difference in their average science achievement ( 559 vs. 428). Students in the countries participating at the sixth grade had relatively few home resources, comparable to the fourth grade countries with the lowest levels of resources.

Science Grade
Reported by Parents, except Number of Books and Study Supports Reported by Students
Students were scored according to their own and their parents' responses concerning the availability of five resources on the Home Resources for Learning scale. Students with Many Resources had a score of at least 11.9, which is the point on the scale corresponding to students reporting they had more than 100 books in the home and two home study supports, and parents reporting that they had more than 25 children's books in the home, that at least one parent had finished university, and that at least one parent had a professional occupation, on average. Students with Few Resources had a score no higher than 7.3 , which is the scale point corresponding to students reporting that they had 25 or fewer books in the home and neither of the two home study supports, and parents reporting that they had 10 or fewer children's books in the home, that neither parent had gone beyond upper-secondary education, and that neither parent was a small business owner or had a clerical or professional occupation, on average. All other students were assigned to the Some Resources category.

| Country |  | Many Resources |  | Some Resources |  | Few Resources |  | Average Scale Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |  |
| Norway |  | 42 (1.6) | 517 (2.7) | 57 (1.6) | 480 (2.3) | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ | 11.5 (0.06) |
| Australia | s | 41 (1.5) | 565 (3.0) | 59 (1.5) | 509 (3.5) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim$ | 11.5 (0.06) |
| Sweden |  | 39 (1.6) | 570 (3.0) | 60 (1.6) | 522 (2.6) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 11.4 (0.05) |
| Finland |  | 33 (1.4) | 596 (2.7) | 67 (1.4) | 560 (2.9) | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ | 11.2 (0.04) |
| Northern Ireland | S | 30 (1.5) | 562 (3.4) | 68 (1.6) | 518 (3.2) | 2 (0.4) | $\sim$ | 10.9 (0.07) |
| Ireland |  | 27 (1.4) | 563 (3.8) | 71 (1.4) | 508 (2.9) | 2 (0.3) | ~ ~ | 10.8 (0.06) |
| Germany | $r$ | 24 (1.4) | 580 (2.6) | 75 (1.4) | 525 (2.8) | 2 (0.3) | ~ ~ | 10.7 (0.07) |
| Singapore |  | 24 (0.9) | 637 (3.7) | 74 (0.9) | 573 (3.4) | 3 (0.3) | 474 (9.5) | 10.7 (0.03) |
| Hungary |  | 21 (1.5) | 600 (3.2) | 69 (1.4) | 535 (2.8) | 11 (1.1) | 447 (8.3) | 10.1 (0.10) |
| Spain |  | 19 (1.3) | 548 (3.6) | 77 (1.2) | 504 (2.7) | 5 (0.5) | 452 (7.9) | 10.3 (0.06) |
| Chinese Taipei |  | 18 (1.0) | 596 (2.2) | 76 (1.0) | 546 (2.3) | 6 (0.4) | 501 (5.5) | 10.2 (0.06) |
| Czech Republic |  | 18 (1.0) | 577 (3.7) | 81 (1.0) | 531 (2.5) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 10.5 (0.04) |
| Slovenia |  | 17 (0.8) | 568 (3.3) | 82 (0.9) | 514 (2.7) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 10.4 (0.04) |
| Austria |  | 17 (1.0) | 576 (2.5) | 82 (0.9) | 527 (2.9) | 2 (0.3) | ~~ | 10.4 (0.06) |
| Portugal |  | 16 (1.0) | 561 (4.0) | 75 (1.0) | 523 (3.8) | 9 (0.7) | 482 (7.9) | 9.9 (0.06) |
| Russian Federation |  | 16 (1.0) | 592 (3.7) | 82 (1.1) | 546 (3.6) | 2 (0.4) | ~ ~ | 10.4 (0.05) |
| Malta |  | 16 (0.5) | 520 (4.2) | 83 (0.6) | 444 (2.4) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 10.3 (0.02) |
| Poland |  | 15 (1.0) | 569 (3.8) | 79 (1.0) | 499 (2.4) | 6 (0.6) | 441 (6.6) | 10.0 (0.06) |
| Slovak Republic |  | 13 (0.8) | 590 (4.1) | 81 (1.1) | 532 (2.9) | 6 (1.0) | 458 (14.6) | 9.9 (0.06) |
| Qatar | r | 12 (0.9) | 478 (12.1) | 84 (0.9) | 397 (4.1) | 4 (0.4) | 320 (12.7) | 10.2 (0.05) |
| Hong Kong SAR |  | 12 (1.0) | 569 (4.4) | 80 (0.9) | 540 (2.9) | 8 (0.7) | 520 (5.6) | 9.8 (0.08) |
| Georgia |  | 12 (1.0) | 502 (4.2) | 80 (1.2) | 457 (3.8) | 8 (1.0) | 400 (11.3) | 9.9 (0.07) |
| Lithuania |  | 11 (0.9) | 566 (4.6) | 83 (1.0) | 513 (2.1) | 6 (0.5) | 461 (8.5) | 9.8 (0.05) |
| United Arab Emirates |  | 10 (0.5) | 516 (5.1) | 84 (0.6) | 428 (2.7) | 6 (0.4) | 369 (5.3) | 9.9 (0.03) |
| Italy |  | 8 (0.7) | 570 (4.5) | 85 (0.8) | 527 (2.7) | 7 (0.6) | 483 (7.0) | 9.7 (0.05) |
| Croatia |  | 7 (0.6) | 560 (4.8) | 88 (0.7) | 515 (1.9) | 5 (0.6) | 475 (7.7) | 9.7 (0.05) |
| Romania |  | 7 (0.7) | 604 (4.6) | 67 (1.8) | 524 (4.1) | 26 (1.7) | 438 (12.1) | 8.7 (0.09) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of |  | 4 (0.5) | 560 (4.7) | 57 (1.7) | 476 (3.4) | 39 (1.9) | 411 (4.1) | 8.1 (0.09) |
| Saudi Arabia |  | 4 (0.6) | 492 (11.0) | 78 (1.2) | 436 (5.2) | 18 (1.2) | 394 (10.6) | 9.0 (0.07) |
| Oman |  | 3 (0.3) | 456 (10.3) | 75 (0.8) | 391 (4.4) | 23 (0.8) | 339 (6.1) | 8.7 (0.04) |
| Morocco | 5 | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 46 (2.1) | 291 (4.3) | 53 (2.1) | 260 (8.0) | 7.2 (0.10) |
| Azerbaijan |  | 1 (0.1) | ~ | 77 (1.3) | 445 (6.1) | 22 (1.3) | 427 (7.1) | 8.5 (0.04) |
| International Avg. |  | 17 (0.2) | 559 (0.9) | 74 (0.2) | 495 (0.6) | 9 (0.1) | 428 (2.0) |  |

* Available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students because this item was included in the PIRLS Home Questionnaire completed by parents.
Centerpoint of scale set at 10 .
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A tilde ( $\sim$ ) indicates insufficient data to report achievement
An" $r$ " indicates data are available for at least $70 \%$ but less than $85 \%$ of the students. An "s" indicates data are available for at least $50 \%$ but less than $70 \%$ of the students.

TIMSS $\mathcal{E}$ PIRLS
International Study Center
Lynch School of Education, Boston College

Exhibit 4.1: Home Resources for Learning* (Continued)
TIMSS $20114^{\text {tit }}$
Science Grade

| Country | Many Resources |  | Some Resources |  | Few Resources |  | Average Scale Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |  |
| Sixth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Botswana | 1 (0.4) | $\sim \sim$ | 57 (1.8) | 416 (7.8) | 42 (1.9) | 333 (6.9) | 7.7 (0.10) |
| Honduras $s$ | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ | 44 (2.5) | 474 (7.3) | 56 (2.5) | 419 (6.2) | 7.1 (0.12) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Quebec, Canada | 29 (1.6) | 546 (3.0) | 71 (1.6) | 508 (2.8) | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ | 11.1 (0.05) |
| Dubai, UAE | 21 (0.5) | 542 (3.6) | 77 (0.6) | 455 (2.5) | 3 (0.2) | 361 (10.1) | 10.6 (0.02) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 8 (1.2) | 497 (13.6) | 85 (1.3) | 413 (4.5) | 6 (0.7) | 359 (7.1) | 9.8 (0.07) |



Exhibit 4.2 provides supporting detail about the availability of the specific home resources included in the Home Resources for Learning scale for the fourth grade assessment. The exhibit presents data on two resource components (More than 100 Books in Their Home as well as both Own Room and Internet Connection in Home) for all participants in the fourth grade TIMSS assessment, as well as data on an additional three resources for countries that participated in both TIMSS and PIRLS with the same students. On average, across all of the countries participating in TIMSS 2011 at the fourth grade, one-fourth of the students were from homes with more than 100 books in total, and slightly more than half (52\%) reported having both their own room and an Internet connection at home. Across the countries participating in both studies at the fourth grade, on average, 30 percent of the students had at least one parent that had earned a university degree and 36 percent had at least one parent in a professional occupation, and the majority of students (58\%) had more than 25 children's books at home.

Exhibit 4.3 presents the results for the TIMSS 2011 eighth grade assessment for the Home Educational Resources scale, which was created based on students' reports about three of the five types of home resources that comprised the fourth grade Home Resources for Learning scale-number of books in the home, availability of two home study supports, and parents' education. The second page of the exhibit provides detail about the questions forming the scale and the categorization of responses. Students were scored according to the availability of the three home study supports, with Many Resources corresponding to more than 100 books in the home, having both their own room and an Internet connection, and at least one parent having completed university, on average. Few Resources corresponds, on average, to having 25 or fewer books, neither home study support, and neither parent having gone beyond upper secondary school.

Countries are ordered by the percentage of students in the Many Resources category, with the eighth grade countries on the first page of the exhibit and the ninth grade and benchmarking participants on the second page. Internationally, on average, two-thirds of the eighth grade students (67\%) were assigned to the Some Resources category. On average, twelve percent were in the Many Resources category and 21 percent were in the Few Resources category, with a 116-point difference in their average science achievement (540 vs. 424).

TIMSS \& PIRLS

Exhibit 4.4 provides supporting detail about the availability of the specific home resources included in the Home Educational Resources scale for the eighth grade assessment. Across the countries participating at the eighth grade, on average, one-fourth of the students had more than 100 books in their home, more than half (53\%) reported having both their own room and an Internet connection at home, and about one-third (32\%) had at least one parent that had earned a university degree.

Exhibit 4.2: Components of the Home Resources for Learning Scale*
TIMSS $2011 \underset{\text { Science }}{4_{\text {Grade }}^{\text {th }}}$
Columns 1-2 Reported by Students and Columns 3-5 Reported by Parents

|  | Percent of Students with |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Country | More than 100 Books in Their Home | Own Room and Internet Connection in Home |  | At Least One Parent with a University Degree or Higher |  | At Least One Parent in a Professional Occupation** |  | More than 25 Children's Books in Their Home |
| Armenia | 29 (0.9) | 30 (1.0) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Australia | 41 (1.0) | 74 (1.0) | s | 42 (1.5) | S | 55 (1.6) | s | 89 (1.0) |
| Austria | 28 (1.3) | 69 (1.0) |  | 21 (1.1) |  | 27 (1.0) |  | 76 (1.8) |
| Azerbaijan | 8 (0.7) | 10 (0.6) |  | 25 (1.1) |  | 18 (0.9) |  | 15 (1.1) |
| Bahrain | 24 (1.0) | 50 (1.5) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Belgium (Flemish) | 26 (1.1) | 79 (0.9) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Chile | 15 (0.5) | 46 (1.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Chinese Taipei | 30 (1.1) | 52 (0.9) |  | 23 (1.3) |  | 35 (1.1) |  | 59 (1.3) |
| Croatia | 16 (0.8) | 64 (1.2) |  | 18 (1.0) |  | 29 (1.2) |  | 43 (1.1) |
| Czech Republic | 34 (1.1) | 58 (1.2) |  | 23 (1.3) |  | 36 (1.3) |  | 79 (0.9) |
| Denmark | 28 (1.2) | 90 (0.8) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| England | 34 (1.3) | 75 (1.4) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Finland | 38 (1.4) | 78 (1.0) |  | 42 (1.4) |  | 50 (1.2) |  | 88 (0.7) |
| Georgia | 35 (1.4) | 34 (1.3) |  | 36 (1.3) |  | 31 (1.2) |  | 38 (1.5) |
| Germany | 35 (1.5) | 71 (1.0) | $r$ | 28 (1.5) | $r$ | 30 (1.3) | $r$ | 81 (1.1) |
| Hong Kong SAR | 25 (1.2) | 56 (1.3) |  | 18 (1.6) |  | 29 (1.6) |  | 52 (1.7) |
| Hungary | 33 (1.5) | 62 (1.4) |  | 26 (1.6) |  | 27 (1.4) |  | 68 (1.4) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of | 14 (0.8) | 23 (1.4) |  | 15 (1.4) |  | 13 (1.1) |  | 25 (1.2) |
| Ireland | 33 (1.5) | 71 (1.0) |  | 33 (1.5) |  | 43 (1.3) |  | 78 (1.1) |
| Italy | 23 (1.0) | 38 (0.8) |  | 20 (1.2) |  | 26 (1.1) |  | 54 (1.2) |
| Japan | 22 (0.9) | 57 (1.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kazakhstan | 17 (1.3) | 28 (1.6) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Korea, Rep. of | 65 (1.3) | 54 (1.3) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kuwait | 25 (1.1) | 54 (1.5) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lithuania | 16 (0.8) | 48 (1.0) |  | 30 (1.4) |  | 29 (1.2) |  | 46 (1.2) |
| Malta | 24 (0.7) | 67 (0.7) | $r$ | 18 (0.6) | $r$ | 32 (0.8) |  | 87 (0.5) |
| Morocco | 9 (0.6) | 16 (0.9) | r | 10 (0.9) | S | $9(0.8)$ | $r$ | 13 (0.8) |
| Netherlands | 26 (1.3) | 87 (0.9) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Zealand | 38 (1.1) | 69 (0.8) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Northern Ireland | 31 (1.4) | 70 (1.1) | s | 35 (1.7) | s | 50 (1.7) | s | 83 (1.2) |
| Norway | 36 (1.4) | 87 (0.8) |  | 58 (2.0) |  | 65 (1.6) |  | 86 (1.2) |
| Oman | 22 (0.9) | 19 (0.7) |  | 22 (0.7) | $r$ | 33 (0.8) |  | 19 (0.6) |
| Poland | 24 (0.9) | 52 (1.1) |  | 30 (1.4) |  | 30 (1.3) |  | 65 (1.0) |
| Portugal | 21 (1.2) | 64 (1.3) |  | 25 (1.1) |  | 33 (1.4) |  | 63 (1.5) |
| Qatar | 27 (0.9) | 51 (1.1) | r | 59 (1.5) | r | 58 (1.6) |  | 36 (1.1) |
| Romania | 15 (1.0) | 42 (1.5) |  | 13 (1.1) |  | 15 (1.2) |  | 32 (1.4) |
| Russian Federation | 25 (1.0) | 40 (1.6) |  | 46 (1.4) |  | 41 (1.2) |  | 65 (1.0) |
| Saudi Arabia | 20 (1.2) | 28 (1.5) |  | 35 (1.5) |  | 36 (1.4) |  | 17 (1.0) |
| Serbia | 16 (0.8) | 57 (1.3) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Singapore | 31 (0.9) | 49 (0.7) |  | 33 (0.9) |  | 56 (0.7) |  | 72 (0.8) |
| Slovak Republic | 26 (1.0) | 47 (1.1) |  | 26 (1.2) |  | 31 (1.2) |  | 58 (1.3) |
| Slovenia | 27 (1.0) | 67 (1.2) |  | 23 (1.1) |  | 40 (1.1) |  | 69 (1.0) |
| Spain | 29 (1.5) | 65 (1.1) |  | 33 (1.6) |  | 33 (1.5) |  | 69 (1.3) |
| Sweden | 39 (1.4) | 84 (0.8) | $r$ | 43 (1.7) | $r$ | 59 (1.5) |  | 86 (0.8) |
| Thailand | 8 (0.7) | 11 (0.7) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Tunisia | 11 (0.7) | 20 (1.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Turkey | 14 (0.8) | 26 (1.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| United Arab Emirates | 22 (0.6) | 42 (0.8) |  | 54 (0.8) | $r$ | 49 (0.9) |  | $32(0.8)$ |
| United States | 28 (0.8) | 64 (0.6) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Yemen | 9 (0.9) | 7 (0.7) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| International Avg. | 25 (0.2) | 52 (0.2) |  | 30 (0.2) |  | 36 (0.2) |  | 58 (0.2) |

* Data reported in columns 3-5 were from the PIRLS Home Questionnaire completed by parents, so data are available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students.
** Includes corporate manager or senior official, professional, and technician or associate professional.
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

An" $r$ " indicates data are available for at least $70 \%$ but less than $85 \%$ of the students. An " $s$ " indicates data are available for at least $50 \%$ but less than $70 \%$ of the students.

TIMSS \& PIRLS

Exhibit 4.2: Components of the Home Resources for Learning Scale* (Continued)
TIMSS $20114^{\text {th }}$ Science Grade

| Country | Percent of Students with |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | More than 100 Books in Their Home | Own Room and Internet Connection in Home |  | At Least One Parent with a University Degree or Higher |  | At Least One Parent in a Professional Occupation** | More than 25 Children's Books in Their Home |
| Sixth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Botswana | 10 (0.7) | 11 (1.0) | S | 10 (1.5) | S | 22 (1.7) | 14 (0.8) |
| Honduras | 6 (0.6) | 17 (1.6) | 5 | 10 (2.3) | S | 13 (1.8) | 11 (0.9) |
| Yemen | 8 (0.5) | 6 (0.6) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Alberta, Canada | 40 (1.3) | 79 (1.1) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ontario, Canada | 37 (1.3) | 74 (1.2) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Quebec, Canada | 28 (1.2) | 82 (1.0) |  | 45 (2.0) |  | 55 (1.5) | 78 (1.2) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 22 (1.1) | 41 (1.5) |  | 52 (1.7) |  | 47 (1.8) | 29 (1.7) |
| Dubai, UAE | 26 (0.6) | 49 (0.9) |  | 67 (0.9) | $r$ | 63 (0.8) | 50 (0.6) |
| Florida, US | 21 (1.1) | 66 (1.3) |  |  |  |  |  |
| North Carolina, US | 27 (1.6) | 68 (1.7) |  |  |  |  |  |


| Reported by Students |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Students were scored according to their responses concerning the availability of three home educational resources on the Home Educational Resources scale. Students with Many Resources had a score of at least 12.5, which is the point on the scale corresponding to students reporting that they had more than 100 books in the home and two home study supports, and that at least one parent had finished university, on average. Students with Few Resources had a score no higher than 8.2, which is the scale point corresponding to students reporting that they had 25 or fewer books in the home, neither of the two home study supports, and that neither parent had gone beyond upper-secondary education, on average. All other students were assigned to the Some Resources category. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Country | Many Resources |  | Some Resources |  | Few Resources |  | Average Scale Score |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |  |
| Korea, Rep. of | 32 (1.4) | 596 (2.6) | 64 (1.3) | 546 (1.7) | 4 (0.3) | 496 (7.0) | 11.4 (0.06) |
| Norway | 32 (1.2) | 530 (3.0) | 67 (1.1) | 480 (2.5) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 11.6 (0.04) |
| Sweden | 27 (1.0) | 554 (2.8) | 71 (1.0) | 498 (2.5) | 2 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 11.3 (0.04) |
| United States | 23 (0.8) | 575 (2.8) | 70 (0.8) | 516 (2.4) | 8 (0.4) | 465 (4.7) | 10.9 (0.04) |
| Finland | 22 (1.0) | 584 (3.0) | 76 (1.0) | 545 (2.4) | 2 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 11.2 (0.04) |
| Australia | 22 (1.4) | 577 (7.6) | 75 (1.3) | 508 (4.0) | 4 (0.4) | 433 (7.7) | 11.2 (0.06) |
| Hungary | 20 (1.0) | 574 (3.2) | 72 (1.0) | 520 (2.4) | 8 (0.9) | 418 (8.2) | 10.8 (0.06) |
| Armenia | 20 (0.9) | 469 (5.4) | 72 (0.8) | 434 (3.1) | 8 (0.5) | 390 (7.4) | 10.8 (0.05) |
| New Zealand | 19 (1.1) | 571 (4.9) | 76 (1.0) | 506 (4.2) | 5 (0.5) | 429 (6.3) | 10.9 (0.06) |
| Russian Federation | 19 (0.9) | 579 (3.8) | 75 (0.9) | 537 (3.1) | 6 (0.6) | 501 (8.3) | 10.8 (0.05) |
| Georgia | 17 (1.0) | 471 (3.7) | 71 (1.1) | 419 (3.0) | 12 (1.0) | 360 (5.9) | 10.5 (0.06) |
| Japan | 17 (1.0) | 593 (4.2) | 78 (0.9) | 553 (2.3) | 5 (0.5) | 497 (7.5) | 10.8 (0.05) |
| England | 17 (1.1) | 597 (5.9) | 79 (1.1) | 526 (4.5) | 5 (0.5) | 439 (13.5) | 10.8 (0.05) |
| Qatar | 17 (0.9) | 472 (8.1) | 74 (1.1) | 419 (3.9) | 10 (0.7) | 329 (7.6) | 10.7 (0.04) |
| Israel r | 16 (1.1) | 575 (6.3) | 82 (1.1) | 519 (4.1) | 2 (0.3) | ~ | 11.0 (0.05) |
| Slovenia | 16 (0.8) | 586 (3.9) | 82 (0.8) | 538 (2.6) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim$ | 10.9 (0.03) |
| Chinese Taipei | 15 (0.6) | 621 (3.8) | 73 (0.8) | 564 (2.1) | 12 (0.7) | 498 (4.1) | 10.4 (0.04) |
| Italy | 13 (0.8) | 549 (3.7) | 75 (1.0) | 501 (2.3) | 12 (0.8) | 451 (6.4) | 10.3 (0.04) |
| Ukraine | 12 (0.9) | 551 (5.3) | 79 (1.0) | 502 (3.1) | 9 (0.9) | 434 (8.7) | 10.4 (0.05) |
| Singapore | 12 (0.6) | 654 (4.5) | 76 (0.7) | 591 (4.0) | 12 (0.6) | 522 (7.5) | 10.3 (0.04) |
| United Arab Emirates | 11 (0.5) | 518 (5.1) | 76 (0.6) | 465 (2.3) | 12 (0.5) | 416 (3.3) | 10.3 (0.03) |
| Lithuania | 11 (0.9) | 561 (4.9) | 81 (1.0) | 515 (2.3) | 8 (0.6) | 443 (7.3) | 10.4 (0.04) |
| Romania | 10 (0.8) | 535 (4.8) | 71 (1.3) | 470 (3.2) | 19 (1.2) | 412 (5.7) | 9.9 (0.06) |
| Hong Kong SAR | 10 (0.8) | 578 (8.2) | 72 (1.0) | 537 (3.2) | 19 (0.8) | 512 (5.1) | 9.9 (0.05) |
| Bahrain | 9 (0.5) | 514 (5.8) | 78 (0.9) | 456 (2.2) | 14 (0.7) | 405 (5.8) | 10.1 (0.03) |
| Kazakhstan | 8 (0.9) | 538 (10.1) | 77 (1.1) | 492 (4.0) | 15 (1.2) | 455 (7.9) | 10.0 (0.07) |
| Macedonia, Rep. of | 7 (0.8) | 505 (10.3) | 77 (1.0) | 416 (4.7) | 16 (1.0) | 335 (7.9) | 9.9 (0.06) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of | 7 (0.7) | 564 (9.6) | 45 (1.6) | 494 (3.9) | 49 (1.8) | 444 (3.5) | 8.6 (0.09) |
| Chile | 6 (0.5) | 528 (6.3) | 72 (1.1) | 467 (2.4) | 21 (1.2) | 424 (3.6) | 9.7 (0.05) |
| Saudi Arabia | 6 (0.5) | 472 (7.7) | 61 (1.4) | 445 (3.8) | 32 (1.6) | 414 (4.9) | 9.4 (0.08) |
| Jordan | 6 (0.5) | 488 (7.2) | 67 (1.0) | 461 (3.5) | 27 (1.0) | 421 (5.1) | 9.5 (0.05) |
| Lebanon | 6 (0.5) | 472 (10.5) | 64 (1.5) | 418 (5.4) | 30 (1.6) | 370 (4.7) | 9.4 (0.07) |
| Oman | 5 (0.3) | 489 (4.7) | 57 (0.9) | 440 (3.2) | 38 (1.0) | 388 (3.8) | 9.0 (0.04) |
| Turkey | 5 (0.7) | 614 (16.4) | 41 (1.4) | 508 (4.2) | 54 (1.7) | 454 (3.3) | 8.4 (0.09) |
| Palestinian Nat'l Auth. | 4 (0.4) | 474 (8.5) | 63 (1.1) | 433 (3.4) | 33 (1.2) | 391 (4.7) | 9.2 (0.05) |
| Malaysia | 4 (0.4) | 526 (9.9) | 61 (1.3) | 444 (5.8) | 35 (1.5) | 386 (6.9) | 9.1 (0.07) |
| Tunisia | 3 (0.4) | 494 (8.6) | 58 (1.3) | 446 (2.9) | 38 (1.4) | 423 (2.3) | 9.0 (0.07) |
| Syrian Arab Republic | 3 (0.3) | 448 (9.3) | 52 (1.4) | 433 (4.6) | 45 (1.5) | 419 (3.9) | 8.7 (0.07) |
| Thailand | 3 (0.5) | 536 (14.2) | 45 (1.3) | 467 (4.8) | 52 (1.5) | 434 (3.8) | 8.5 (0.06) |
| Morocco | 3 (0.2) | 448 (8.4) | 38 (1.0) | 391 (2.6) | 59 (1.1) | 366 (2.6) | 8.0 (0.05) |
| Ghana | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 37 (1.7) | 318 (7.1) | 62 (1.8) | 301 (5.1) | 7.9 (0.08) |
| Indonesia | 1 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ | 46 (1.9) | 414 (5.3) | 54 (2.0) | 400 (4.6) | 8.4 (0.06) |
| International Avg. | 12 (0.1) | 540 (1.1) | 67 (0.2) | 480 (0.6) | 21 (0.2) | 424 (1.0) |  |

[^0]() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A tilde (~) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.
An"r"indicates data are available for at least 70\% but less than $85 \%$ of the students

TIMSS \& PIRLS
International Study Center
tymch School of Education, Boston college

| Country | Many Resources |  | Some Resources |  | Few Resources |  | Average Scale Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |  |
| Ninth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Honduras | 3 (0.4) | 419 (13.5) | 43 (1.4) | 384 (5.3) | 53 (1.6) | 354 (3.6) | 8.5 (0.07) |
| South Africa | 3 (0.2) | 504 (9.9) | 55 (0.8) | 347 (4.0) | 42 (0.8) | 305 (4.1) | 8.7 (0.03) |
| Botswana | 2 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 49 (1.0) | 414 (4.6) | 50 (1.1) | 396 (3.2) | 8.4 (0.04) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Massachusetts, US | 35 (2.1) | 605 (5.2) | 61 (2.0) | 552 (5.1) | 4 (0.5) | 468 (11.9) | 11.5 (0.08) |
| Connecticut, US | 32 (1.8) | 587 (4.8) | 64 (1.8) | 514 (4.1) | 4 (0.6) | 432 (11.5) | 11.4 (0.08) |
| Minnesota, US | 32 (2.1) | 590 (5.5) | 65 (1.9) | 539 (4.0) | 3 (0.5) | 475 (11.6) | 11.5 (0.07) |
| Colorado, US | 28 (1.7) | 587 (4.4) | 63 (1.7) | 532 (3.9) | 9 (0.9) | 472 (7.8) | 11.0 (0.08) |
| Alberta, Canada | 27 (1.2) | 576 (3.3) | 71 (1.1) | 536 (2.4) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 11.4 (0.04) |
| Ontario, Canada | 26 (1.4) | 555 (3.6) | 73 (1.3) | 510 (2.4) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ | 11.4 (0.06) |
| North Carolina, US | 24 (1.9) | 583 (8.9) | 69 (1.8) | 519 (5.4) | 7 (0.8) | 479 (9.3) | 11.0 (0.08) |
| Indiana, US | 21 (1.7) | 579 (4.7) | 74 (1.5) | 525 (4.3) | 5 (0.5) | 466 (8.3) | 10.9 (0.07) |
| Quebec, Canada | 19 (0.8) | 560 (3.0) | 80 (0.8) | 512 (2.6) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 11.1 (0.03) |
| Florida, US | 17 (1.4) | 590 (9.2) | 76 (1.4) | 524 (6.7) | 8 (1.0) | 481 (14.2) | 10.7 (0.08) |
| Alabama, US | 16 (2.0) | 544 (8.0) | 75 (1.9) | 481 (5.8) | 9 (0.8) | 423 (7.1) | 10.5 (0.10) |
| Dubai, UAE | 15 (0.6) | 546 (5.6) | 76 (0.7) | 482 (2.6) | 9 (0.4) | 415 (6.2) | 10.6 (0.03) |
| California, US | 15 (1.1) | 564 (5.9) | 70 (1.1) | 496 (4.6) | 15 (1.1) | 451 (6.9) | 10.3 (0.07) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 11 (0.9) | 508 (10.3) | 76 (1.0) | 463 (3.9) | 13 (0.8) | 416 (4.7) | 10.3 (0.05) |



Reported by Students

| Country | Percent of Students with |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | More than 100 Books in Their Home | Own Room and Internet Connection in Home | At Least One Parent with a University Degree or Higher |
| Armenia | 32 (1.1) | 47 (1.2) | 59 (1.4) |
| Australia | 42 (1.4) | 86 (0.8) | 31 (1.8) |
| Bahrain | 19 (0.7) | 61 (0.7) | 33 (1.1) |
| Chile | 15 (0.7) | 53 (1.0) | 21 (1.0) |
| Chinese Taipei | 34 (0.8) | 57 (0.7) | 26 (0.9) |
| England | 33 (1.5) | 89 (0.8) | 31 (1.8) |
| Finland | 41 (1.1) | 91 (0.5) | 42 (1.2) |
| Georgia | 37 (1.4) | 43 (1.1) | 33 (1.5) |
| Ghana | 8 (0.7) | 5 (0.5) | 10 (0.7) |
| Hong Kong SAR | 24 (1.1) | 58 (0.9) | 20 (1.4) |
| Hungary | 41 (1.3) | 79 (1.0) | 26 (1.3) |
| Indonesia | 4 (0.4) | 14 (1.1) | 12 (1.0) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of | 15 (0.9) | 24 (1.2) | 15 (1.2) |
| Israel | 38 (1.2) | -- | 48 (1.2) |
| Italy | 34 (0.9) | 58 (1.0) | 24 (1.1) |
| Japan | 31 (1.2) | 73 (1.1) | 41 (1.4) |
| Jordan | 16 (0.7) | 26 (1.0) | 35 (1.1) |
| Kazakhstan | 17 (1.2) | 37 (1.7) | 36 (1.5) |
| Korea, Rep. of | 56 (1.3) | 70 (0.9) | 49 (1.7) |
| Lebanon | 16 (1.1) | 39 (1.6) | 25 (1.4) |
| Lithuania | 24 (1.1) | 67 (1.0) | 24 (1.1) |
| Macedonia, Rep. of | 13 (1.0) | 71 (1.3) | 29 (1.7) |
| Malaysia | 10 (0.8) | 31 (1.4) | 15 (1.3) |
| Morocco | 7 (0.4) | 25 (0.9) | 22 (0.8) |
| New Zealand | 40 (1.5) | 83 (0.9) | x x |
| Norway | 45 (1.4) | 96 (0.5) | 62 (1.2) |
| Oman | 21 (0.7) | 22 (0.8) | 24 (0.8) |
| Palestinian Nat'I Auth. | 13 (0.8) | 25 (1.0) | 28 (1.1) |
| Qatar | 25 (1.2) | 67 (1.1) | 65 (1.0) |
| Romania | 19 (1.0) | 61 (1.4) | 20 (1.1) |
| Russian Federation | 31 (1.0) | 59 (1.3) | 49 (1.5) |
| Saudi Arabia | 14 (0.7) | 40 (1.5) | 37 (1.7) |
| Singapore | 26 (0.8) | 56 (0.7) | 30 (0.9) |
| Slovenia | 27 (0.9) | 85 (0.8) | 31 (1.1) |
| Sweden | 42 (1.1) | 94 (0.4) | 47 (1.4) |
| Syrian Arab Republic | 10 (0.6) | 14 (0.9) | 31 (1.3) |
| Thailand | 7 (0.6) | 23 (1.1) | 17 (1.3) |
| Tunisia | 9 (0.6) | 33 (1.5) | 19 (1.2) |
| Turkey | 17 (1.1) | 32 (1.5) | 9 (1.0) |
| Ukraine | 25 (1.1) | 48 (1.9) | 39 (1.3) |
| United Arab Emirates | 21 (0.6) | 55 (0.6) | 52 (0.9) |
| United States | 33 (0.9) | 79 (0.5) | 55 (1.0) |
| International Avg. | 25 (0.2) | 53 (0.2) | 32 (0.2) |

() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A dash (-) indicates comparable data not available.
An " $x$ " indicates data are available for less than $50 \%$ of students.

TIMSS \& PIRLS
International Study Center Lynch School of Education, Boston College

| Country | Percent of Students with |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | More than 100 Books in Their Home | Own Room and Internet Connection in Home | At Least One Parent with a University Degree or Higher |
| Ninth Grade Participants |  |  |  |
| Botswana | 8 (0.5) | 10 (0.6) | 19 (0.9) |
| Honduras | 8 (0.6) | 24 (1.3) | 15 (1.1) |
| South Africa | 9 (0.4) | 25 (0.7) | 19 (0.7) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |
| Alberta, Canada | 43 (1.2) | 91 (0.8) | 52 (1.7) |
| Ontario, Canada | 41 (1.6) | 86 (0.9) | 51 (1.7) |
| Quebec, Canada | 27 (0.9) | 93 (0.6) | 51 (1.3) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 21 (0.9) | 55 (1.3) | 52 (1.7) |
| Dubai, UAE | 27 (1.0) | 58 (0.8) | 57 (1.1) |
| Alabama, US | 23 (2.0) | 79 (1.3) | 51 (2.4) |
| California, US | 25 (1.5) | 67 (1.4) | 40 (1.5) |
| Colorado, US | 39 (1.7) | 82 (1.6) | 54 (2.0) |
| Connecticut, US | 43 (1.6) | 84 (1.0) | 68 (2.6) |
| Florida, US | 27 (1.6) | 80 (1.3) | 52 (2.2) |
| Indiana, US | 32 (1.7) | 82 (1.0) | 53 (2.6) |
| Massachusetts, US | 46 (2.0) | 85 (0.8) | 71 (2.1) |
| Minnesota, US | 43 (2.1) | 85 (0.9) | 70 (1.6) |
| North Carolina, US | 33 (2.0) | 84 (1.0) | 60 (2.2) |

## Students Spoke the Language of the Test

TIMSS has previously shown that, with some exceptions, countries with large proportions of students from homes where the language of the test (and consequently the language of instruction) is not often spoken had lower average science achievement than students who spoke the language of the test more often. Because learning any school subject is dependent on having a mastery of the language of instruction, which in turn is influenced by children's early language experiences, the language or languages spoken at home and how they are used are important factors in subsequent school achievement. As formal science instruction begins, children are likely to be at an initial disadvantage if their knowledge of the language of instruction is substantially below the expected level for their age.

Exhibit 4.5 shows parents' reports about whether students who participated in the fourth grade TIMSS 2011 assessment spoke the language of the test before starting school. For students in the fourth grade, 91 percent across countries, on average, spoke the language of the test before starting school. However, the 9 percent who did not speak the language of the test before starting school had lower average science achievement on TIMSS 2011 ( 460 vs . 500). The results for the sixth grade and benchmarking students show that only about one-fourth ( $26 \%$ ) of the students in Botswana spoke the language of the test before starting school, which is the lowest percentage among all entities that participated in the TIMSS 2011 fourth grade assessment.

In the TIMSS 2011 eighth grade assessment, students themselves reported on how often they speak the language of the test at home. As shown in Exhibit 4.6, for the eighth grade students, on average across countries, 79 percent always or almost always speak the language of the test at home, with 17 percent sometimes speaking it and 4 percent never speaking it. As with the fourth grade, average science achievement was higher for students who frequently speak the language of the test at home (481), compared to those who sometimes (448) or never (424) do so. Among the ninth grade participants, both Botswana and South Africa had very low percentages of students always or almost always speaking the language of the test at home ( $12 \%$ and $26 \%$, respectively). These two countries had the lowest percentages of students speaking the language of the test at home, along with eighth grade participants Ghana (26\%) and Tunisia (19\%).

Reported by Parents

| Country |  | Spoke the Language |  | Did Not Speak the Language |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Australia | s | 95 (0.6) | 531 (3.1) | 5 (0.6) | 520 (13.1) |
| Austria |  | 93 (0.6) | 537 (2.7) | 7 (0.6) | 472 (5.5) |
| Azerbaijan |  | 96 (0.9) | 440 (5.4) | 4 (0.9) | 429 (17.9) |
| Chinese Taipei |  | 97 (0.3) | 554 (2.2) | 3 (0.3) | 517 (9.0) |
| Croatia |  | 100 (0.1) | 516 (2.1) | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Czech Republic |  | 99 (0.3) | 538 (2.3) | 1 (0.3) | ~ ~ |
| Finland |  | 99 (0.2) | 572 (2.5) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Georgia |  | 98 (0.7) | 458 (3.4) | 2 (0.7) | ~ ~ |
| Germany | $r$ | 97 (0.3) | 536 (2.7) | 3 (0.3) | 477 (7.4) |
| Hong Kong SAR |  | 97 (0.4) | 541 (2.8) | 3 (0.4) | 535 (7.0) |
| Hungary |  | 99 (0.2) | 537 (3.6) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of |  | 80 (1.5) | 468 (3.4) | 20 (1.5) | 396 (6.9) |
| Ireland |  | 93 (0.6) | 523 (3.3) | 7 (0.6) | 481 (7.3) |
| Italy |  | 94 (0.5) | 528 (2.7) | 6 (0.5) | 501 (6.7) |
| Lithuania |  | 98 (0.6) | 516 (2.5) | 2 (0.6) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Malta |  | 44 (0.8) | 478 (2.6) | 56 (0.8) | 430 (2.6) |
| Morocco |  | 83 (1.9) | 266 (5.3) | 17 (1.9) | 253 (7.9) |
| Northern Ireland | 5 | 98 (0.4) | 530 (3.0) | 2 (0.4) | ~ ~ |
| Norway |  | 97 (0.4) | 496 (2.3) | 3 (0.4) | 456 (8.2) |
| Oman |  | 94 (0.3) | 378 (4.5) | 6 (0.3) | 399 (6.1) |
| Poland |  | 99 (0.1) | 506 (2.6) | 1 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Portugal |  | 98 (0.3) | 524 (3.5) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Qatar | $r$ | 73 (1.7) | 409 (5.4) | 27 (1.7) | 437 (6.8) |
| Romania |  | 97 (1.1) | 508 (5.9) | 3 (1.1) | 456 (11.9) |
| Russian Federation |  | 96 (1.0) | 553 (3.3) | 4 (1.0) | 534 (12.9) |
| Saudi Arabia |  | 74 (1.4) | 435 (5.7) | 26 (1.4) | 418 (7.6) |
| Singapore |  | 82 (0.5) | 591 (3.4) | 18 (0.5) | 555 (4.8) |
| Slovak Republic |  | 98 (0.6) | 535 (3.4) | 2 (0.6) | ~ ~ |
| Slovenia |  | 97 (0.3) | 524 (2.7) | 3 (0.3) | 456 (8.1) |
| Spain |  | 87 (1.1) | 511 (2.8) | 13 (1.1) | 486 (4.8) |
| Sweden | $r$ | 95 (0.4) | 541 (2.7) | 5 (0.4) | 479 (7.0) |
| United Arab Emirates |  | 77 (0.8) | 428 (2.5) | 23 (0.8) | 443 (4.3) |
| International Avg. |  | 91 (0.1) | 500 (0.6) | 9 (0.1) | 460 (1.8) |

Sixth Grade Participants

| Botswana | $26(1.3)$ | $417(9.6)$ | $74(1.3)$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Honduras | $97(0.5)$ | $431(6.0)$ | $3(0.5)$ |

Benchmarking Participants

| Quebec, Canada | $94(0.8)$ | $520(2.7)$ | $6(0.8)$ | $503(6.7)$ |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | $81(1.4)$ | $409(4.7)$ | $19(1.4)$ | $436(8.4)$ |
| Dubai, UAE | $69(0.7)$ | $470(2.8)$ | $31(0.7)$ | $462(3.1)$ |

* Available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students because this item was included in the PIRLS Home Questionnaire completed by parents.
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A tilde (~) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.
$A n$ " $r$ " indicates data are available for at least $70 \%$ but less than $85 \%$ of the students. An "s" indicates data are available for at least 50\% but less than 70\% of the students.

Reported by Students

| Country | Always or Almost Always |  | Sometimes |  | Never |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Armenia | 94 (0.5) | 439 (3.1) | 5 (0.4) | 414 (8.3) | 1 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Australia | 93 (0.9) | 521 (4.8) | 6 (0.8) | 497 (9.1) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Bahrain | 77 (0.7) | 451 (2.5) | 18 (0.6) | 469 (4.1) | 5 (0.5) | 431 (10.2) |
| Chile | 96 (0.3) | 464 (2.5) | 4 (0.3) | 413 (7.2) | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Chinese Taipei | 92 (0.7) | 570 (2.1) | 7 (0.6) | 501 (5.5) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| England | 95 (0.7) | 536 (4.9) | 4 (0.6) | 489 (11.9) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim$ |
| Finland | 97 (0.4) | 554 (2.5) | 2 (0.3) | ~ ~ | 1 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Georgia | 95 (0.9) | 424 (2.9) | 4 (0.9) | 352 (10.0) | 0 (0.1) | ~~ |
| Ghana | 26 (1.1) | 308 (6.9) | 70 (1.2) | 311 (5.4) | 4 (0.7) | 228 (8.4) |
| Hong Kong SAR | 79 (1.9) | 531 (3.3) | 17 (1.6) | 555 (8.1) | 3 (0.5) | 538 (14.7) |
| Hungary | 98 (0.3) | 524 (3.0) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Indonesia | 36 (2.9) | 409 (8.1) | 56 (2.4) | 406 (3.9) | 7 (0.9) | 398 (8.8) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of | 64 (2.2) | 493 (4.3) | 21 (1.5) | 443 (6.2) | 15 (1.3) | 438 (4.7) |
| Israel | 93 (0.9) | 516 (3.8) | 6 (0.7) | 523 (12.0) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Italy | 89 (1.0) | 508 (2.3) | 9 (0.8) | 445 (6.6) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Japan | 99 (0.2) | 558 (2.5) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Jordan | 88 (0.8) | 453 (3.7) | 9 (0.6) | 446 (7.6) | 3 (0.4) | 396 (13.1) |
| Kazakhstan | 92 (0.8) | 492 (4.5) | 8 (0.8) | 473 (5.9) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Korea, Rep. of | 100 (0.1) | 560 (2.0) | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Lebanon | 20 (1.3) | 431 (8.2) | 64 (1.4) | 403 (5.2) | 16 (0.7) | 385 (7.1) |
| Lithuania | 96 (0.8) | 516 (2.5) | 3 (0.7) | 471 (15.8) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Macedonia, Rep. of | 91 (1.0) | 412 (5.5) | 6 (0.7) | 369 (11.6) | 2 (0.5) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Malaysia | 62 (2.0) | 430 (6.5) | 25 (1.3) | 433 (8.7) | 13 (1.1) | 400 (13.3) |
| Morocco | 63 (1.2) | 373 (2.3) | 29 (0.9) | 384 (3.1) | 8 (0.6) | 381 (6.8) |
| New Zealand | 92 (0.9) | 516 (4.4) | 7 (0.7) | 487 (9.4) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Norway | 94 (0.7) | 498 (2.5) | 5 (0.6) | 443 (8.3) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Oman | 65 (1.3) | 424 (3.5) | 28 (1.1) | 423 (3.9) | 7 (0.5) | 396 (9.2) |
| Palestinian Nat'l Auth. | 93 (1.1) | 422 (3.3) | 5 (0.7) | 406 (9.2) | 2 (0.6) | ~ ~ |
| Qatar | 65 (0.9) | 420 (4.4) | 29 (0.8) | 428 (4.1) | 6 (0.5) | 360 (10.3) |
| Romania | 98 (0.3) | 467 (3.5) | 1 (0.3) | ~ ~ | 0 (0.1) | ~~ |
| Russian Federation | 92 (1.9) | 544 (3.4) | 7 (1.7) | 521 (7.8) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Saudi Arabia | 75 (2.0) | 441 (3.8) | 16 (1.2) | 428 (7.6) | 9 (1.1) | 411 (7.7) |
| Singapore | 57 (0.9) | 611 (3.8) | 38 (0.8) | 565 (5.5) | 5 (0.3) | 550 (9.3) |
| Slovenia | 88 (1.7) | 548 (2.8) | 8 (1.0) | 494 (7.5) | 4 (1.0) | 522 (9.0) |
| Sweden | 92 (0.6) | 516 (2.5) | 6 (0.5) | 450 (6.3) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Syrian Arab Republic | 85 (1.5) | 428 (3.7) | 11 (1.0) | 413 (7.9) | 4 (0.8) | 426 (18.8) |
| Thailand | 66 (2.3) | 466 (4.3) | 30 (2.1) | 423 (5.3) | 3 (0.5) | 404 (10.4) |
| Tunisia | 19 (0.7) | 424 (3.7) | 56 (1.1) | 441 (2.6) | 25 (0.9) | 445 (3.8) |
| Turkey | 90 (1.2) | 492 (3.8) | 8 (1.0) | 410 (6.6) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Ukraine | 61 (2.7) | 500 (4.5) | 27 (1.8) | 503 (4.3) | 12 (1.4) | 502 (5.2) |
| United Arab Emirates | 67 (1.2) | 465 (2.4) | 27 (0.9) | 467 (3.7) | 5 (0.4) | 448 (5.2) |
| United States | 91 (0.4) | 530 (2.6) | 8 (0.4) | 487 (5.1) | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| International Avg. | 79 (0.2) | 481 (0.6) | 17 (0.2) | 448 (1.2) | 4 (0.1) | 424 (2.3) |

[^1]Exhibit 4.6: Students Speak the Language of the Test at Home (Continued)
TIMSS $20118^{\text {ith }}$

| Country | Always or Almost Always |  | Sometimes |  | Never |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Ninth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Botswana | 12 (0.6) | 426 (10.0) | 82 (0.7) | 406 (3.0) | 7 (0.4) | 354 (6.4) |
| Honduras | 95 (0.4) | 371 (4.0) | 4 (0.4) | 326 (12.4) | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| South Africa | 26 (1.0) | 412 (5.9) | 65 (1.2) | 310 (3.4) | 9 (0.6) | 264 (6.1) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Alberta, Canada | 86 (1.6) | 549 (2.3) | 11 (1.2) | 527 (5.0) | 3 (0.7) | 528 (7.6) |
| Ontario, Canada | 89 (0.9) | 521 (2.5) | 10 (0.8) | 521 (7.9) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Quebec, Canada | 89 (1.1) | 522 (2.6) | 8 (0.8) | 501 (5.6) | 3 (0.4) | 522 (10.2) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 69 (1.8) | 461 (4.0) | 25 (1.4) | 469 (7.1) | 6 (0.7) | 444 (7.1) |
| Dubai, UAE | 62 (1.4) | 492 (2.6) | 34 (1.3) | 476 (4.1) | 4 (0.5) | 466 (8.5) |
| Alabama, US | 97 (0.5) | 488 (6.4) | 3 (0.5) | 450 (16.6) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| California, US | 81 (1.4) | 506 (4.4) | 18 (1.3) | 474 (7.5) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim$ |
| Colorado, US | 88 (1.1) | 550 (4.1) | 11 (1.2) | 486 (9.1) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim$ |
| Connecticut, US | 91 (0.7) | 539 (4.3) | 8 (0.6) | 480 (7.5) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Florida, US | 88 (1.3) | 534 (7.5) | 11 (1.2) | 522 (13.0) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Indiana, US | 96 (0.5) | 536 (4.9) | 3 (0.4) | 468 (12.2) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Massachusetts, US | 91 (1.0) | 573 (4.8) | 8 (0.9) | 498 (16.9) | 1 (0.3) | ~ ~ |
| Minnesota, US | 96 (0.8) | 557 (4.4) | 4 (0.8) | 489 (10.8) | 0 (0.2) | $\sim$ |
| North Carolina, US | 95 (0.7) | 534 (6.4) | 5 (0.7) | 499 (11.0) | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |

## Parents' Educational Expectations for Their Children

Studies over the past several years have found a positive relationship between parental aspirations for their children and academic achievement. For example, researchers studying longitudinal effects in the United States found that more communication between parents and students as well as higher parents' aspirations resulted in higher student achievement (Hong \& Ho, 2005). Across four ethnic groups, parents' educational aspiration was the most powerful predictor of increasing student educational aspiration; ultimately, the greater the student's own educational expectations, the greater the student's academic achievement.

Exhibit 4.7 presents parents' reports about their educational expectations for their children according to four education levels from highest to lowest: postgraduate degree, university degree, post-secondary, and upper secondary (or lower). Results are shown for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS fourth grade assessments to the same fourth grade students. Across the TIMSS 2011 participants, parents have very high educational expectations for their children (to the extent that some parents may have misunderstood the question). Nearly one-third ( $30 \%$ ) of the fourth grade students have parents who expect them to attain a postgraduate degree and another third (35\%) are expected to graduate from university. Still, there was considerable variation in results across and within countries.

Consistent with other research, the results show a positive relationship between parents' aspirations and students' average science achievement. Across the fourth grade countries, students' average science achievement increased with each successively higher level of education expected by their parents, to the extent that there was a 81 -point difference between students whose parents expected a postgraduate degree at one end of the continuum and those whose parents expected upper secondary school (or lower) at the other end of the continuum (524 vs. 443). The results for the sixth grade and benchmarking participants were similar to the results at the fourth grade.

TIMSS \& PIRLS

Reported by Parents

| Country |  | Parents Expect Their Child to Complete |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Postgraduate Degree** |  | University but Not Postgraduate Degree |  | Post-secondary but Not University |  | Upper Secondary Education or Less |  |
|  |  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | $\begin{gathered} \text { Average } \\ \text { Achievement } \end{gathered}$ | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of |  | 75 (0.9) | 469 (4.1) | 12 (0.5) | 438 (5.7) | 10 (0.6) | 399 (7.4) | 3 (0.4) | 358 (11.7) |
| United Arab Emirates |  | 59 (0.7) | 454 (2.8) | 31 (0.6) | 413 (2.9) | 6 (0.3) | 396 (5.4) | 5 (0.3) | 348 (6.9) |
| Qatar |  | 58 (1.0) | 429 (4.6) | 33 (1.1) | 375 (5.8) | 3 (0.3) | 321 (12.6) | 6 (0.4) | 318 (11.5) |
| Poland |  | 52 (1.2) | 530 (3.0) | 25 (0.9) | 505 (2.6) | 6 (0.5) | 479 (6.2) | 18 (0.9) | 444 (4.7) |
| Saudi Arabia |  | 49 (1.8) | 450 (6.2) | 32 (1.3) | 424 (6.8) | 8 (0.8) | 389 (9.4) | 11 (1.0) | 392 (10.2) |
| Slovak Republic |  | 48 (1.4) | 567 (2.7) | 6 (0.4) | 539 (5.5) | 13 (0.5) | 527 (4.0) | 33 (1.4) | 489 (5.2) |
| Portugal |  | 48 (1.0) | 543 (3.1) | 36 (0.9) | 519 (3.9) | 6 (0.6) | 480 (8.3) | 10 (0.7) | 482 (8.0) |
| Oman |  | 43 (0.7) | 410 (4.3) | 40 (0.7) | 376 (4.9) | 6 (0.3) | 338 (9.4) | 12 (0.5) | 302 (6.9) |
| Morocco | r | 42 (1.4) | 294 (5.2) | 21 (0.9) | 265 (5.8) | 0 (0.0) | ~~ | 37 (1.5) | 243 (8.7) |
| Chinese Taipei |  | 42 (1.0) | 576 (2.3) | 44 (0.7) | 545 (2.5) | $9(0.5)$ | 525 (5.3) | $5(0.5)$ | 470 (7.2) |
| Singapore |  | 34 (0.8) | 605 (4.0) | 47 (0.8) | 597 (3.1) | 18 (0.8) | 528 (3.8) | 2 (0.2) | ~ |
| Georgia |  | 32 (1.4) | 498 (3.5) | 20 (1.0) | 466 (5.3) | 24 (1.2) | 437 (4.7) | 24 (1.2) | 410 (6.3) |
| Spain |  | 28 (1.1) | 525 (3.5) | 52 (1.2) | 517 (2.9) | 7 (0.5) | 476 (5.5) | 12 (0.8) | 462 (4.7) |
| Ireland |  | 27 (1.0) | 540 (3.6) | 42 (1.1) | 533 (3.9) | 26 (1.3) | 493 (3.3) | 5 (0.4) | 464 (8.5) |
| Azerbaijan |  | 27 (1.2) | 459 (5.4) | 40 (1.3) | 447 (6.8) | 15 (1.1) | 417 (9.2) | 18 (1.2) | 415 (8.3) |
| Hong Kong SAR |  | 26 (1.1) | 554 (3.5) | $62(0.9)$ | 542 (3.1) | 6 (0.5) | 516 (5.1) | 6 (0.5) | 502 (5.8) |
| Finland |  | 26 (1.3) | 596 (3.4) | 29 (0.8) | 578 (2.8) | 12 (0.7) | 568 (4.7) | 33 (1.2) | 549 (3.5) |
| Lithuania |  | 23 (1.0) | 554 (3.5) | 32 (1.0) | 531 (2.6) | 34 (1.0) | 494 (2.3) | 11 (0.7) | 452 (6.1) |
| Czech Republic |  | 22 (1.0) | 576 (3.3) | 14 (0.7) | 564 (3.8) | 6 (0.5) | 553 (5.8) | 58 (1.3) | 517 (2.7) |
| Romania |  | 21 (1.3) | 562 (4.4) | 29 (1.5) | 545 (4.5) | 16 (1.0) | 507 (6.2) | 34 (2.1) | 436 (10.7) |
| Germany | $r$ | 20 (1.1) | 579 (3.4) | 9 (0.5) | 558 (3.5) | 16 (0.8) | 522 (3.6) | 55 (1.3) | 519 (3.3) |
| Northern Ireland | 5 | 18 (1.1) | 562 (4.4) | 37 (1.4) | 550 (3.6) | 13 (0.8) | 524 (5.6) | 32 (1.5) | 493 (4.5) |
| Australia | 5 | 18 (1.1) | 555 (6.7) | 42 (1.5) | 554 (3.0) | 25 (1.2) | 505 (4.3) | 15 (0.9) | 487 (6.0) |
| Hungary |  | 16 (1.2) | 605 (3.5) | 30 (1.0) | 570 (2.7) | 24 (0.8) | 531 (3.3) | 30 (1.3) | 474 (5.7) |
| Italy |  | 15 (0.7) | 534 (5.0) | 49 (0.9) | 540 (2.7) | 12 (0.6) | 505 (5.9) | 24 (0.9) | 509 (3.9) |
| Malta |  | 13 (0.6) | 508 (4.9) | 25 (0.6) | 495 (3.1) | 29 (0.8) | 456 (4.1) | 33 (0.8) | 395 (3.5) |
| Croatia |  | 9 (0.4) | 541 (4.5) | 34 (1.1) | 538 (2.3) | 48 (1.0) | 507 (2.2) | $9(0.6)$ | 465 (5.2) |
| Slovenia |  | 7 (0.5) | 564 (5.5) | 42 (1.1) | 546 (2.8) | 36 (0.9) | 505 (3.0) | 14 (0.8) | 469 (5.3) |
| Norway |  | 5 (0.5) | 485 (7.1) | 64 (1.6) | 507 (2.5) | 26 (1.4) | 480 (3.0) | 5 (0.6) | 467 (7.4) |
| Russian Federation |  | 3 (0.3) | 594 (8.3) | 69 (1.2) | 566 (3.3) | 23 (1.0) | 519 (4.1) | 6 (0.6) | 516 (8.4) |
| Austria |  | -- | - - | - - | - - | -- | -- | - - | -- |
| Sweden |  | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |
| International Avg. |  | 30 (0.2) | 524 (0.8) | 35 (0.2) | 505 (0.7) | 16 (0.1) | 479 (1.1) | 19 (0.2) | 443 (1.3) |

Sixth Grade Participants

| Botswana | r | 52 (1.9) | 401 (8.1) | 15 (0.8) | 381 (9.2) | 19 (1.1) | 344 (7.6) | 14 (1.0) | 316 (6.0) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Honduras | $r$ | 36 (1.8) | 465 (8.0) | 22 (1.3) | 445 (7.1) | 14 (0.9) | 430 (7.4) | 28 (1.6) | 395 (6.9) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Dubai, UAE |  | 66 (0.8) | 486 (2.4) | 25 (0.8) | 448 (4.3) | 6 (0.5) | 425 (8.1) | 3 (0.3) | 363 (9.7) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE |  | 59 (1.3) | 438 (5.2) | 32 (1.0) | 393 (5.1) | 5 (0.5) | 371 (9.7) | 5 (0.5) | 333 (11.9) |
| Quebec, Canada |  | 18 (1.4) | 533 (4.5) | 43 (1.3) | 529 (2.5) | 33 (1.5) | 503 (3.2) | 6 (0.7) | 485 (6.6) |

* Available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students because this item was included in the PIRLS Home Questionnaire completed by parents.
*     * For example, doctorate, master's, or other postgraduate degree or diploma.
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A dash (-) indicates comparable data not available. A tilde ( $\sim$ ) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.
An " $r$ " indicates data are available for at least $70 \%$ but less than $85 \%$ of the students. An "s" indicates data are available for at least $50 \%$ but less than $70 \%$ of the students.

Exhibit 4.8 presents students' reports of their educational aspirations from the TIMSS 2011 eighth grade assessment. As shown on the first page and similar to the parents of the fourth grade students, the eighth grade students had high expectations for further education, such that some students also may have misunderstood the question. However, looking at the countries that administered TIMSS and PIRLS to the same students at the fourth grade and also participated at the eighth grade, there was some degree of correspondence between the parents' responses and those by eighth grade students. Almost onethird $(29 \%)$ of the eighth grade students expect to attain a postgraduate degree and more than one-fourth (27\%) expect to graduate from university. Fifteen percent of the eighth grade students indicated that they did not know how far in school they would go.

The eighth grade results also show a positive relationship between educational aspirations (in this case those of the students themselves) and average science achievement. Across the eighth grade countries, the students at each higher level of education expectation had higher average science achievement than the level below. Students expecting a postgraduate degree had a 99-point advantage in average achievement compared to those expecting to go no further than upper secondary school, about a full standard deviation on the TIMSS achievement scale (513 vs. 412). The results for the ninth grade and benchmarking participants were similar to the results at the eighth grade.

## Students Attended Preprimary Education

Preprimary education, in the form of preschool, kindergarten, or an early childhood education program, plays an important role in preparing children for primary school. For example, recent PIRLS assessments have found a positive relationship between years of preprimary education and reading achievement in the fourth grade. Also, recent analyses of longitudinal data in the United States and England found that preschool attendance was positively related to enhanced school performance, and that the duration of attendance was associated with greater academic improvement (Tucker-Drob, 2012; Sammons, et al., 2002). Besides giving students an early start in school and life, there are also broader reasons for countries to invest in preschool (Economist Intelligence Unit, 2012). For example, preprimary education provides an avenue for overcoming children's disadvantages and can help to break the generational repetitive cycle of poverty and low achievement.

Although there is considerable variation across countries, according to the TIMSS 2011 Encyclopedia, some countries already have mandatory preprimary education (e.g., Austria, Hungary, and the Netherlands), some have nearly 100 percent enrollment even though attendance is not mandatory (e.g., Australia, Croatia, and Singapore), and a number of the remaining countries are working to increase enrollment in preprimary education. Of course, school policies of entering primary school at older ages (e.g., age 7 in Finland, Lithuania, and Sweden) permit opportunities for more years of preschool attendance than when children start primary school at younger ages (e.g., age 4 or 5 in England, Ireland, the Netherlands, New Zealand, and Northern Ireland). Exhibit C. 1 in Appendix C contains information across countries, about the different policies and practices about the age of entry to primary school.

Exhibit 4.9 presents the TIMSS 2011 parents' reports on the number of years their children participated in preprimary education for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students. In addition, for all participants in the fourth grade TIMSS 2011 assessment, the exhibit presents National Research Coordinators' reports of whether or not there was a national preprimary curriculum that includes science skills. It is noted that these preprimary curricula may involve only rudimentary observation and classification skills as well as perhaps experiencing some technology, yet twothirds of the TIMSS 2011 fourth grade countries indicated that their preprimary curriculum made such provision, as did all of the benchmarking participants. None of the three sixth grade countries reported a preprimary curriculum that included science skills.

Although attendance in preprimary education differed dramatically from country to country, on average, 43 percent of the fourth grade students had at least three years of preprimary education and another 33 percent had less than three years but more than one year; eleven percent had only one year or less of preprimary education. Students with three years had higher average achievement (505) than their counterparts with less than three but more than one year (497) or one year or less of preprimary education (478). Most notably, however, the 13 percent of students, on average, that did not attend preschool had much lower average science achievement (454). There was a range across countries, but the majority of students did not attend preschool in Azerbaijan (64\%) and Saudi Arabia (52\%). Also, among the sixth grade participants, the majority of students in Botswana (56\%) did not attend preprimary education.

Reported by Students

| Country | Postgraduate Degree* |  | University but Not Postgraduate Degree |  | Post-secondary but Not University |  | Upper Secondary Education or Less |  | Do Not Know |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Saudi Arabia | 62 (1.3) | 454 (3.7) | 14 (0.7) | 433 (5.7) | 0 (0.0) | $\sim \sim$ | 10 (0.8) | 372 (7.5) | 15 (0.9) | 408 (4.8) |
| Qatar | 54 (1.0) | 456 (4.3) | 25 (0.9) | 411 (5.4) | 4 (0.4) | 351 (10.6) | 8 (0.5) | 287 (7.4) | 9 (0.6) | 373 (8.1) |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of | 53 (1.0) | 501 (4.7) | 15 (0.6) | 465 (3.3) | 6 (0.3) | 425 (5.6) | 5 (0.4) | 383 (6.4) | 20 (0.7) | 451 (4.4) |
| Israel | 51 (1.2) | 546 (3.9) | 19 (0.8) | 536 (3.6) | 10 (0.6) | 474 (5.6) | 10 (0.8) | 431 (6.3) | 10 (0.5) | 493 (6.7) |
| Palestinian Nat'I Auth. | 49 (0.9) | 452 (3.9) | 11 (0.7) | 440 (5.4) | 6 (0.4) | 411 (6.6) | 12 (0.8) | 348 (7.4) | 22 (1.1) | 390 (5.0) |
| Tunisia | 49 (1.0) | 457 (3.2) | 5 (0.4) | 442 (5.8) | 13 (0.6) | 418 (3.5) | 7 (0.4) | 401 (4.1) | 27 (0.9) | 426 (2.5) |
| United Arab Emirates | 48 (0.7) | 497 (2.3) | 21 (0.5) | 470 (3.1) | 9 (0.3) | 440 (3.3) | 7 (0.3) | 364 (4.7) | 14 (0.5) | 429 (3.4) |
| Oman | 45 (0.8) | 465 (3.1) | 17 (0.5) | 430 (4.4) | 5 (0.3) | 382 (8.7) | 11 (0.5) | 338 (7.0) | 23 (0.7) | 391 (4.0) |
| Jordan | 45 (0.9) | 487 (3.0) | 19 (0.7) | 462 (4.0) | 6 (0.4) | 405 (7.4) | $9(0.6)$ | 367 (7.9) | 21 (0.8) | 429 (4.9) |
| Lebanon | 42 (1.4) | 441 (5.9) | 29 (1.1) | 415 (4.7) | 8 (0.6) | 348 (6.7) | 6 (0.6) | 334 (10.6) | 15 (0.9) | 366 (6.0) |
| Indonesia | 42 (1.6) | 418 (5.7) | 19 (0.9) | 415 (4.7) | 7 (0.5) | 399 (7.0) | 13 (0.9) | 390 (5.7) | 20 (1.2) | 387 (5.2) |
| United States | 40 (0.7) | 547 (2.8) | 43 (0.5) | 521 (2.6) | 4 (0.2) | 490 (4.8) | 6 (0.3) | 463 (5.7) | 7 (0.3) | 508 (4.1) |
| Bahrain | 39 (0.9) | 497 (2.6) | 16 (0.6) | 464 (4.2) | 9 (0.5) | 432 (5.9) | 15 (0.5) | 363 (5.8) | 21 (0.8) | 438 (4.9) |
| Morocco | 37 (0.8) | 409 (2.5) | 16 (0.6) | 377 (3.5) | 0 (0.0) | ~ ~ | 16 (0.7) | 336 (3.6) | 30 (1.0) | 369 (2.6) |
| Singapore | 33 (0.7) | 625 (3.6) | 36 (0.8) | 600 (3.7) | 18 (0.9) | 521 (6.4) | 1 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ | 12 (0.5) | 578 (7.3) |
| Macedonia, Rep. of | 33 (1.3) | 455 (5.8) | 43 (1.1) | 416 (5.2) | 3 (0.3) | 360 (14.1) | 13 (0.8) | 337 (7.0) | 8 (0.6) | 353 (11.6) |
| Hong Kong SAR | 32 (1.2) | 560 (4.1) | 40 (1.1) | 542 (3.0) | 11 (0.7) | 503 (5.4) | 8 (0.8) | 466 (7.7) | 10 (0.5) | 522 (6.5) |
| Armenia | 29 (1.1) | 480 (3.7) | 8 (0.5) | 462 (6.5) | 13 (0.6) | 417 (6.2) | 22 (0.9) | 391 (5.2) | 29 (0.8) | 434 (3.7) |
| Malaysia | 28 (1.6) | 474 (6.1) | 20 (1.0) | 452 (5.3) | 24 (1.1) | 406 (5.3) | 10 (1.1) | 337 (11.5) | 17 (1.0) | 400 (8.3) |
| Turkey | 28 (1.1) | 549 (6.0) | 44 (0.9) | 490 (3.0) | 5 (0.3) | 451 (5.5) | 16 (0.8) | 393 (3.8) | 7 (0.4) | 427 (6.2) |
| Chinese Taipei | 27 (1.0) | 617 (3.1) | 46 (0.8) | 563 (2.0) | 5 (0.3) | 534 (4.9) | 12 (0.7) | 474 (4.2) | 10 (0.5) | 552 (5.3) |
| Ghana | 27 (1.7) | 367 (7.2) | 42 (1.4) | 312 (4.9) | 18 (1.0) | 267 (6.8) | 8 (0.6) | 208 (7.9) | 5 (0.6) | 293 (16.6) |
| Thailand | 25 (1.4) | 489 (5.9) | 32 (1.0) | 465 (3.5) | 7 (0.5) | 430 (5.1) | 22 (1.0) | 417 (4.3) | 13 (0.8) | 422 (4.8) |
| Syrian Arab Republic | 25 (1.0) | 453 (4.7) | 34 (1.2) | 431 (4.9) | 4 (0.3) | 410 (7.4) | 14 (1.2) | 396 (7.0) | 22 (0.9) | 417 (4.7) |
| Hungary | 22 (1.0) | 580 (3.1) | 20 (0.8) | 550 (2.6) | 23 (0.9) | 512 (3.9) | 26 (1.1) | 461 (4.3) | 8 (0.5) | 525 (5.7) |
| Italy | 22 (1.0) | 530 (4.3) | 28 (0.9) | 528 (2.3) | 12 (0.6) | 494 (4.3) | 31 (1.1) | 467 (3.5) | 8 (0.5) | 484 (5.8) |
| England | 20 (1.4) | 574 (5.8) | 17 (1.1) | 570 (6.1) | 25 (1.1) | 520 (4.7) | 21 (1.2) | 494 (5.6) | 16 (0.8) | 520 (8.0) |
| Kazakhstan | 20 (0.9) | 503 (5.8) | 40 (1.1) | 504 (4.9) | 15 (0.7) | 481 (5.3) | 18 (0.9) | 463 (5.6) | 7 (0.5) | 475 (7.0) |
| Georgia | 20 (1.2) | 482 (3.5) | 7 (0.7) | 452 (6.6) | 22 (1.1) | 438 (4.4) | 36 (1.2) | 377 (4.3) | 15 (0.9) | 414 (5.1) |
| New Zealand | 20 (0.9) | 550 (5.5) | 13 (0.7) | 551 (5.5) | 20 (0.6) | 511 (4.1) | 21 (1.0) | 473 (4.7) | 26 (0.9) | 508 (5.2) |
| Australia | 20 (1.2) | 570 (7.8) | 14 (0.7) | 552 (6.3) | 30 (1.0) | 508 (4.2) | 22 (1.1) | 470 (4.6) | 15 (0.7) | 534 (6.7) |
| Lithuania | 19 (0.8) | 557 (3.8) | 17 (0.8) | 548 (3.4) | 32 (0.9) | 506 (3.3) | 14 (0.7) | 454 (5.0) | 18 (0.7) | 499 (4.3) |
| Korea, Rep. of | 18 (0.6) | 588 (4.1) | 55 (0.7) | 571 (1.8) | 11 (0.5) | 528 (3.9) | 4 (0.3) | 465 (6.4) | 11 (0.6) | 528 (3.5) |
| Romania | 17 (0.9) | 516 (5.1) | 28 (1.0) | 499 (3.8) | 15 (0.6) | 465 (4.4) | 29 (1.3) | 417 (4.5) | 10 (0.6) | 438 (6.6) |
| Chile | 17 (0.8) | 515 (3.9) | 52 (1.0) | 470 (2.3) | 18 (0.7) | 433 (3.5) | 10 (0.6) | 411 (4.1) | 4 (0.3) | 444 (8.8) |
| Slovenia | 15 (0.8) | 586 (4.1) | 20 (0.8) | 583 (3.5) | 46 (1.0) | 525 (3.2) | 8 (0.5) | 478 (6.6) | 12 (0.6) | 539 (4.5) |
| Finland | 12 (0.7) | 596 (4.2) | 10 (0.5) | 573 (3.5) | 8 (0.4) | 545 (4.7) | 41 (1.2) | 533 (2.2) | 29 (1.0) | 560 (3.2) |
| Norway | 9 (0.6) | 516 (6.2) | 39 (1.0) | 513 (3.4) | 22 (0.7) | 489 (3.4) | 7 (0.5) | 443 (8.1) | 23 (0.9) | 487 (4.0) |
| Russian Federation | 6 (0.5) | 585 (4.8) | 53 (1.1) | 561 (3.3) | 18 (0.8) | 520 (4.5) | 15 (0.9) | 502 (6.4) | 7 (0.4) | 515 (4.8) |
| Ukraine | 4 (0.5) | 556 (9.2) | 30 (1.2) | 532 (3.8) | 21 (0.9) | 497 (4.5) | 38 (1.5) | 480 (5.3) | 6 (0.6) | 481 (7.2) |
| Japan | 2 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 46 (1.0) | 582 (2.7) | 20 (0.7) | 547 (3.3) | 20 (0.8) | 507 (3.6) | 12 (0.6) | 550 (4.3) |
| Sweden | - - | - | -- | -- | -- | - - | - - | - - | -- | - - |
| International Avg. | $29(0.2)$ | 513 (0.8) | 27 (0.1) | 492 (0.7) | 14 (0.1) | 456 (0.9) | 15 (0.1) | 412 (1.0) | 15 (0.1) | 457 (1.0) |

* For example, doctorate, master's, or other postgraduate degree or diploma.
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A dash (-) indicates comparable data not available. A tilde ( $\sim$ ) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.

TIMSS \& PIRLS
International Study Center
International Study Center
Lymh school of Eductation boston college

Exhibit 4.8: Students' Educational Expectations (Continued)
TIMSS $20118^{\text {in }}$ Science Grade

| Country | Postgraduate Degree* |  | University but Not Postgraduate Degree |  | Post-secondary but Not University |  | Upper Secondary <br> Education or Less |  | Do Not Know |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Ninth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| South Africa | 45 (1.0) | 394 (3.6) | 9 (0.4) | 360 (7.3) | 15 (0.4) | 308 (4.3) | 25 (0.7) | 274 (3.9) | 6 (0.6) | 275 (7.9) |
| Honduras | 29 (1.3) | 393 (6.3) | 35 (0.8) | 368 (4.9) | 21 (1.0) | 365 (4.4) | 6 (0.5) | 327 (6.4) | 9 (0.7) | 348 (7.2) |
| Botswana | 27 (1.0) | 477 (3.9) | 19 (0.7) | 427 (3.8) | 28 (0.8) | 392 (4.6) | 20 (0.9) | 330 (4.0) | 4 (0.3) | 373 (9.1) |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Dubai, UAE | 51 (1.2) | 513 (2.6) | 19 (0.7) | 486 (4.4) | 12 (0.6) | 455 (4.9) | 5 (0.3) | 357 (7.2) | 13 (0.6) | 463 (4.6) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | 50 (1.1) | 492 (4.0) | 20 (0.8) | 462 (5.9) | 8 (0.6) | 436 (6.1) | 7 (0.5) | 371 (6.8) | 15 (0.7) | 424 (6.0) |
| North Carolina, US | 46 (1.9) | 551 (6.8) | 42 (1.5) | 523 (5.5) | 2 (0.5) | ~ | 4 (0.5) | 459 (10.4) | 6 (0.5) | 522 (18.0) |
| Florida, US | 46 (2.1) | 549 (9.2) | 39 (1.3) | 526 (6.3) | 3 (0.5) | 486 (18.7) | 6 (1.2) | 493 (14.6) | 7 (0.6) | 515 (12.9) |
| Alberta, Canada | 42 (1.1) | 564 (2.7) | 22 (0.8) | 547 (3.1) | 17 (0.8) | 524 (2.9) | 4 (0.5) | 502 (5.7) | 14 (0.6) | 534 (4.7) |
| Massachusetts, US | 42 (1.6) | 590 (5.3) | 43 (1.5) | 559 (5.5) | 3 (0.3) | 526 (10.3) | 3 (0.4) | 492 (12.4) | $9(0.8)$ | 547 (8.5) |
| Ontario, Canada | 41 (1.3) | 544 (3.1) | 23 (0.8) | 523 (3.6) | 21 (1.0) | 490 (3.8) | 2 (0.3) | $\sim$ | 14 (0.6) | 506 (4.5) |
| Connecticut, US | 41 (1.8) | 558 (5.2) | 41 (1.4) | 528 (4.5) | 3 (0.3) | 503 (12.8) | 5 (0.6) | 448 (11.3) | $9(0.9)$ | 524 (7.8) |
| Alabama, US | 41 (1.8) | 511 (7.3) | 40 (1.3) | 481 (5.7) | 4 (0.5) | 449 (15.4) | 8 (1.0) | 421 (8.3) | 7 (0.6) | 480 (9.4) |
| Colorado, US | 41 (1.4) | 566 (4.5) | 43 (1.5) | 538 (4.9) | 3 (0.4) | 495 (14.4) | 6 (0.6) | 473 (7.2) | 7 (0.8) | 518 (8.5) |
| Indiana, US | 40 (1.8) | 555 (5.1) | 44 (1.2) | 528 (4.3) | 4 (0.5) | 488 (10.7) | 5 (0.6) | 469 (9.0) | 7 (0.5) | 516 (8.7) |
| California, US | 39 (1.6) | 525 (4.9) | 41 (1.2) | 493 (5.0) | 4 (0.5) | 476 (12.4) | 7 (0.8) | 448 (11.1) | 8 (0.4) | 475 (7.9) |
| Minnesota, US | 37 (1.3) | 575 (5.3) | 48 (1.2) | 549 (5.1) | 3 (0.4) | 525 (9.8) | 4 (0.6) | 484 (12.1) | 8 (0.7) | 531 (6.0) |
| Quebec, Canada | 34 (1.2) | 538 (3.1) | 26 (0.8) | 528 (3.3) | 23 (0.9) | 495 (2.8) | 4 (0.4) | 474 (7.4) | 13 (0.7) | 518 (4.2) |

Curriculum Reported by National Research Coordinators and Preprimary Attendance Reported by Parents

| Country | National <br> Preprimary <br> Curriculum Includes <br> Science Skills |  | Students Attended Preprimary Education |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | 3 Years or More |  | Less than 3 Years but More than 1 Year |  | 1 Year or Less |  | Did Not Attend |  |
|  |  |  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Hungary |  | $\bigcirc$ | 86 (0.9) | 545 (3.3) | 12 (0.7) | 494 (6.7) | 1 (0.3) | $\sim \sim$ | 0 (0.1) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Italy |  | - | 74 (0.9) | 532 (2.7) | 23 (0.8) | 513 (3.6) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Germany | $r$ | $\bigcirc$ | 74 (0.9) | 538 (2.9) | 23 (0.9) | 527 (3.6) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Sweden |  | - | 74 (1.1) | 545 (2.6) | 20 (1.0) | 528 (3.6) | 2 (0.4) | $\sim \sim$ | 3 (0.4) | 496 (10.6) |
| Norway |  | - | 72 (1.6) | 499 (2.2) | 24 (1.4) | 485 (4.1) | 2 (0.2) | ~ ~ | 3 (0.5) | 488 (12.5) |
| Austria |  | $\bigcirc$ | 69 (1.5) | 534 (2.7) | 27 (1.3) | 534 (4.5) | 3 (0.7) | 531 (8.9) | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Russian Federation |  | $\bigcirc$ | 68 (1.3) | 556 (3.4) | 14 (0.8) | 552 (5.4) | 3 (0.3) | 543 (9.1) | 15 (1.0) | 540 (5.2) |
| Hong Kong SAR |  | $\bigcirc$ | 68 (1.0) | 543 (3.1) | 31 (1.0) | 539 (3.1) | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ | 0 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Czech Republic |  | $\bigcirc$ | 68 (1.1) | 541 (2.7) | 28 (0.9) | 533 (4.0) | 3 (0.4) | 536 (7.2) | 1 (0.2) | $\sim \sim$ |
| Spain |  | $\bigcirc$ | 66 (1.1) | 515 (2.9) | 28 (1.0) | 498 (3.6) | 4 (0.4) | 487 (7.3) | 3 (0.3) | 490 (7.6) |
| Slovak Republic |  | $\bigcirc$ | 65 (1.3) | 545 (2.9) | 24 (0.8) | 524 (4.4) | 8 (0.7) | 506 (6.9) | 4 (0.7) | 484 (18.1) |
| Singapore |  | $\bigcirc$ | 64 (0.7) | 597 (3.4) | 34 (0.7) | 567 (4.0) | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ | 1 (0.1) | ~ ~ |
| Slovenia |  | $\bigcirc$ | 59 (1.3) | 527 (2.9) | 26 (1.1) | 519 (4.1) | 5 (0.5) | 509 (5.5) | 9 (0.7) | 506 (5.5) |
| Romania |  | - | 57 (1.9) | 532 (5.0) | 33 (1.3) | 490 (7.2) | 4 (0.7) | 446 (16.2) | 6 (1.0) | 393 (18.5) |
| Lithuania |  | $\bigcirc$ | 52 (1.2) | 526 (2.6) | 17 (0.6) | 516 (4.8) | 7 (0.5) | 509 (5.3) | 24 (1.3) | 492 (4.5) |
| Finland |  | - | 46 (1.3) | 572 (2.7) | 31 (1.0) | 569 (3.4) | 21 (1.1) | 575 (4.2) | 1 (0.3) | ~ ~ |
| Portugal |  | $\bigcirc$ | 46 (1.3) | 530 (3.6) | 37 (1.3) | 527 (4.5) | 8 (0.7) | 509 (5.9) | 9 (0.8) | 499 (6.2) |
| Croatia |  | $\bigcirc$ | 44 (1.6) | 528 (2.2) | 19 (0.8) | 517 (2.6) | 10 (1.2) | 497 (5.0) | 27 (1.6) | 504 (3.8) |
| Georgia |  | $\bigcirc$ | 42 (1.3) | 462 (4.0) | 29 (0.9) | 462 (4.9) | 7 (0.6) | 462 (6.3) | 22 (1.3) | 439 (5.5) |
| Chinese Taipei |  | - | 38 (0.9) | 558 (2.7) | 56 (0.9) | 551 (2.3) | 4 (0.4) | 536 (8.5) | 1 (0.2) | ~ |
| Poland |  | $\bigcirc$ | 34 (1.3) | 528 (3.1) | 23 (1.0) | 510 (3.2) | 16 (1.1) | 490 (4.2) | 28 (1.9) | 484 (3.6) |
| Morocco | $r$ | - | 21 (0.9) | 287 (5.3) | 39 (1.6) | 269 (6.8) | 17 (1.0) | 249 (6.9) | 23 (1.7) | 255 (10.7) |
| Australia | s | Varies by state | 14 (0.9) | 541 (6.4) | 55 (1.4) | 534 (3.2) | 25 (1.2) | 524 (4.2) | 5 (0.5) | 506 (9.0) |
| Qatar |  | $\bigcirc$ | 12 (0.9) | 393 (8.2) | 51 (1.5) | 422 (4.9) | 19 (0.8) | 389 (7.3) | 18 (1.2) | 360 (8.9) |
| United Arab Emirates |  | $\bigcirc$ | 12 (0.3) | 421 (5.4) | 49 (0.9) | 436 (2.3) | 16 (0.4) | 443 (4.0) | 22 (0.7) | 424 (4.1) |
| Malta |  | - | 11 (0.6) | 458 (5.0) | 86 (0.6) | 450 (2.1) | 3 (0.3) | 452 (10.4) | 1 (0.2) | ~ ~ |
| Iran, Islamic Rep. of |  | $\bigcirc$ | 10 (0.8) | 476 (8.6) | 29 (1.1) | 473 (4.0) | 40 (1.2) | 456 (3.8) | 21 (1.5) | 413 (6.2) |
| Oman |  | - | 8 (0.4) | 383 (7.0) | 36 (0.8) | 401 (5.0) | 25 (0.6) | 376 (5.2) | 31 (0.8) | 356 (5.5) |
| Azerbaijan |  | $\bigcirc$ | 7 (0.6) | 446 (6.8) | 20 (1.3) | 445 (6.7) | 8 (0.5) | 430 (9.2) | 64 (1.7) | 439 (6.4) |
| Ireland |  | $\bigcirc$ | 7 (0.6) | 505 (7.0) | 56 (1.4) | 526 (3.5) | 25 (1.1) | 521 (4.6) | 12 (0.7) | 498 (8.1) |
| Northern Ireland | s | $\bigcirc$ | 4 (0.5) | 546 (11.7) | 49 (1.7) | 532 (3.6) | 44 (1.7) | 527 (3.3) | 3 (0.4) | 501 (10.7) |
| Saudi Arabia |  | $\bigcirc$ | 3 (0.3) | 439 (11.9) | 20 (1.4) | 451 (5.8) | 25 (1.3) | 441 (6.4) | 52 (2.2) | 416 (7.5) |
| Armenia |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bahrain |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Belgium (Flemish) |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Chile |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Denmark |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| England |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Japan |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kazakhstan |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Korea, Rep. of |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kuwait |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Netherlands |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Zealand |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Serbia |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Thailand |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Tunisia |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Turkey |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| United States |  | Varies by state |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Yemen |  | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| International Avg. |  |  | 43 (0.2) | 505 (0.9) | 33 (0.2) | 497 (0.8) | 11 (0.1) | 478 (1.4) | 13 (0.2) | 454 (1.9) |

[^2]* Available only for countries that administered both TIMSS and PIRLS to the same fourth grade students because this item was included in the PIRLS Home Questionnaire completed by parents.
() Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

A tilde ( $\sim$ ) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.
An " " indicates data are available for at least $70 \%$ but less than $85 \%$ of the students. An "s" indicates data are available for at least $50 \%$ but less than $70 \%$ of the students.

TIMSS \& PIRLS

| Country | National Preprimary Curriculum Includes Science Skills | Students Attended Preprimary Education |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 3 Years or More |  | Less than 3 Years but More than 1 Year |  | 1 Year or Less |  | Did Not Attend |  |
|  |  | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement | Percent of <br> Students | Average Achievement | Percent of Students | Average Achievement |
| Sixth Grade Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Honduras | $\bigcirc$ | 21 (1.6) | 411 (10.1) | 36 (1.7) | 448 (7.2) | 28 (1.6) | 438 (6.0) | 15 (1.0) | 419 (8.0) |
| Botswana r | $\bigcirc$ | 15 (0.8) | 420 (10.2) | 22 (1.2) | 433 (9.4) | 7 (0.6) | 401 (11.5) | 56 (1.9) | 339 (5.6) |
| Yemen | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Benchmarking Participants |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Dubai, UAE | $\bigcirc$ | 14 (0.6) | 457 (5.2) | 46 (0.8) | 479 (2.7) | 17 (0.6) | 485 (5.7) | 23 (1.0) | 445 (4.8) |
| Abu Dhabi, UAE | - | 12 (0.6) | 412 (10.1) | 50 (1.6) | 419 (4.9) | 18 (0.8) | 420 (6.4) | 21 (1.0) | 405 (6.6) |
| Quebec, Canada | $\bigcirc$ | 11 (0.7) | 525 (4.5) | 32 (1.5) | 516 (2.8) | 51 (1.6) | 521 (3.0) | 5 (0.5) | 507 (8.0) |
| Alberta, Canada | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ontario, Canada | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Florida, US | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| North Carolina, US | $\bigcirc$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


[^0]:    Centerpoint of scale set at 10

[^1]:    () Standard errors appear in parentheses. Because of rounding some results may appear inconsistent.

    A tilde ( $\sim$ ) indicates insufficient data to report achievement.

[^2]:    - Yes $\bigcirc$ No

